



Institutional Review of Higher Education Institutions in Albania

**Report of HEI "Tirana Business
University"
June 2017**

REVIEW TEAM:

1 Mr Grant Horsburgh

Lead Reviewer



2 Professor As. Ana Kapaj

Reviewer



3 Mr Kevin Kendall

Reviewer

Kevin Kendall

Contents

About this review.....	1
The context of this review	2
Summary report	3
Summary of findings	5
Detailed report	7
Evaluation Area 1: The Organisation and its Management.....	7
Evaluation Area 2: Resourcing.....	10
Evaluation Area 3: The Curriculum.....	14
Evaluation Area 4: Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research	17
Evaluation Area 5: Students and their Support.....	20
Evidence list.....	23

About this review

The overall aim of Institutional Review is to assess the extent to which each higher education institution (HEI) meets the Albanian State Quality Standards which came into force in 2011. Institutional Review is a peer-review process with each review team composed of a mix of UK reviewers appointed by QAA and Albanian reviewers appointed by APAAL. The review team is led by a QAA reviewer.

The resulting reports will serve not only for institutional accreditation based on the extent to which the HEI meets the standards, but will also to inform the HEIs, Albanian government, the public and students of how each HEI meets the standards. This report also helps the HEI to identify priorities for enhancement (the process by which higher education providers systematically improve the quality of provision and the ways in which students' learning is supported).

The Albanian State Quality Standards have been grouped under five headings, the Evaluation Areas: the Organisation and its Management; Resourcing; the Curriculum; Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research; and Students and their Support. This report identifies features of good practice, recommendations, affirmations of actions in progress and weaknesses for each Evaluation Area, together with a judgement as to how well the HEI meets the standards. The judgements that the reviewers may assign are: standards are fully met; standards are substantially met; standards are partly met; or standards are not met.

Finally, the reviewers conclude by recommending a summary judgement to APAAL's Accreditation Council. This overall judgement is one of four levels:

- **State Quality Standards are met**
- **State Quality Standards are substantially met**
- **State Quality Standards are partly met**
- **State Quality Standards are not met.**

As part of the report-writing process, QAA has provided expert support to the review team by ensuring that the team supports the findings made in the report with evidence, and also by proofreading and summarising the full report for the summary below.

The context of this review

HEI Tirana Business University (TBU) is a private higher education institution which offers first and second-cycle programmes in the general subject areas of business management, economics and law. TBU was granted its current institutional and programme accreditation in 2013. The University was founded in 2010 with the objective of providing a high quality teaching and learning experience to small student cohorts with the aim of achieving a high graduate employment rate.

At the time of this review TBU consists of two main units and four departments: a Faculty of Business Administration comprising the Department of General Studies and Department of Professional Studies, and a Faculty of Business Law, comprising the Department of General Studies and Department of Professional Studies. In addition, each faculty hosts a research centre, Centre for Economic Study and Research and the Centre for Legal Study and Research respectively and there are seven administrative units. The University employs 16 full-time and 33 part-time academic teaching staff and offers two first-cycle (bachelor) and 12 second-cycle (10 professional master's and two Master of Science) programmes of study. There are 287 undergraduate students, 23 Master of Science students and 151 professional master's students enrolled on PBU's programmes. **[SER p4; M3; HEI info on APAAL site]**

Summary report

Tirana Business University (TBU) is a private higher education institution based in rented accommodation situated in the city centre and has been operating in its current form since 2010. TBU has approximately 461 students and offers two first-cycle (bachelor) and 12 second-cycle (10 professional master's and two Master of Science) programmes of study. The University has 16 full-time academic staff organised into two main units, the Faculty of Business Administration and Faculty of Business Law. In addition, each faculty hosts a research centre (the Centre for Economic Study and Research and the Centre for Legal Study and Research) and there are seven administrative units.

A self-evaluation report (SER) was developed by a small team of four staff, one of whom is the Head of Student Affairs and also a master's student. The team was led by the Head of the Internal Quality Assurance Unit and team members included academic representatives from both faculties. Drafts were circulated electronically to a wider audience within the University, including the Student Council, before being finalised and then approved by the Academic Senate and Administrative Council. While helpful in providing the review team with relevant information on institutional policies and procedures, the self-evaluation report was mainly descriptive and lacked evaluation of the effectiveness of the policies and procedures.

The visit took place over two days on the 12 and 13 June 2017. The review team was made up of two senior higher education reviewers from the United Kingdom and one experienced higher education member of staff from an Albanian institution. The review team was supported by a Review Manager and a note-taker provided by the Albanian Public Accreditation Agency for Higher Education (APAAL). The review team received a self-evaluation report and the portfolio of supporting evidence eight weeks in advance of the review visit, later supplemented by additional requested documentation before and during the visit. A wide range of supporting information provided by TBU enabled the team to familiarise themselves with the structure, policies, management procedures and nature of teaching and research activity undertaken. Evidence included the Statute, regulations, the Annual Report to the Ministry, a variety of internal reports, admission and orientation procedures, list of external agreements and memoranda, examples of programme information and evidence of deliberative meetings.

The review team met senior managers, the self-evaluation team, students, lecturers, administrative and support staff, as well as external partners and alumni during the review visit. Discussion supported the clarification of procedures, responsibilities and viewpoints. Notes were taken at all meetings. As part of a tour of accommodation the review team viewed the library, teaching areas, computing rooms, student social facilities, and offices.

The Standards for the Organisation and its Management are fully met. In reaching this judgement, the review team did not record any features of good practice, identify any weaknesses and did not affirm any actions already in progress. The institutional structures work in accordance with the Statute and its formally constituted committees ensure efficient management. There is in place a current and appropriate Development Strategy and evidence to demonstrate effective internal monitoring and evaluation of all activities. Market research is an institutional strength. However, international partnership arrangements are still in the early stages of development.

The Standards for Resourcing are substantially met. In reaching this judgement, the review team did not record any features of good practice and did not affirm any actions already in progress. However, the review team has made two recommendations for the University to consider as a means of securing further the quality and standard of its programmes. The absence of a coordinated personal password protected information system (virtual learning

environment) is a weakness and it the review team recommend that the University investigates and installs appropriate software to enable access to personal information and dedicated teaching and learning resources appropriate to each programme being studied (**Chapter III Standard VII.1**). The TBU building is not adequately accessible to physically disabled students, which is a weakness and the review team recommends that the University develop and implement a defined plan to ensure that physically disabled students can access all learning and teaching facilities (**Chapter III Standard VII.3 and Chapter III Standard VII.5**).

The Standards for the Curriculum are fully met. In reaching this judgement the review team identified one feature of **good practice**; the direct link between teaching and the application of taught theory in a practical setting in bachelor and master's study programmes which results in employers providing a high number of positive career destinations (**Chapter III Standard VII.1**). The review team did not identify any weaknesses and did not affirm any actions already in progress.

The Standards for Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research are partially met. In reaching this judgement the review team identified one feature of good practice; the TBU's practice to publicise research outcomes through an effective supporting policy to organise, run and host international seminars and scientific symposia (**Chapter II Standard I.7**). However, the review team has made three recommendations for the University to consider as a means of further securing the quality and standard of its programmes and of enhancing further the learning experience of its students. The absence of specific research priorities, analysis and discussion within departments is a weakness and the review team **recommends** that the University ensures that departments take responsibility for promoting, coordinating and managing the scientific research work of established research groups (**Chapter II Standard I.1**). The absence of a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities is a weakness and the review team recommends that the University develops and implements a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities (**Chapter II Standard I.4 and Chapter II Standard I.5**). The lack of international research activity and mobility opportunities for staff and students is a weakness and the review team recommends that the University seek to establish bilateral agreements and projects to facilitate international research activity and mobility opportunities for staff and students (**Chapter II, Standard I.3 and Chapter II, Standard I.6**). The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

The Standards for Students and their Support are fully met. In reaching this judgement the review team identified one feature of good practice; the proactive role of the Careers Office in establishing and maintaining partnership agreements with private businesses and banks which results in high student employment (**Chapter I, Standard III.9**). The review team did not identify any weaknesses and did not affirm any actions already in progress.

TBU undertook the review in accordance with APAAL guidelines. The review team acknowledge the University's engagement in the process and the cooperation provided to the review team throughout the visit phase.

Summary of findings

Good practice

The review team identified the following features of good practice:

- the direct link between teaching and the application of taught theory in a practical setting in bachelor and master's study programmes which results in employers providing a high number of positive career destinations (paragraph 3.10; **Chapter III Standard VII.1**)
- the University's practice to publicise research outcomes through an effective supporting policy to organise, run and host international seminars and scientific symposia (paragraph 4.9; **Chapter II Standard I.7**)
- the proactive role of the Careers Office in establishing and maintaining partnership agreements with private businesses and banks which results in high student employment (paragraph 5.9; **Chapter I Standard III.9**).

Weaknesses

The review team identified the following weaknesses:

- the absence of a coordinated personal password protected information system (virtual learning environment) (paragraph 2.8; **Chapter III Standard VII.1**)
- the TBU building not meeting adequately requirements regarding accessibility for physically disabled students (paragraph 2.11; **Chapter III Standard VII.3 and Chapter III Standard VII.5**)
- the absence of specific research priorities, analysis and discussion within departments (paragraph 4.5; **Chapter II Standard I.1**)
- the absence of a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities (paragraph 4.7; **Chapter II Standard I.4 and Chapter II Standard I.5**)
- the lack of international research activity and mobility opportunities for staff and students (paragraph 4.8; **Chapter II Standard I.3 and Chapter I Standard I.6**).

Recommendations

The review team identified the following recommendations:

- the University investigates and installs appropriate software to enable access to personal information and dedicated teaching and learning resources appropriate to each programme being studied (paragraph 2.8; **Chapter III Standard VII.1**)
- the University develops and implements a defined plan to ensure that physically disabled students can access all learning and teaching facilities (paragraph 2.11; **Chapter III Standard VII.3 and Chapter III Standard VII.5**)
- as a matter of urgency, the University take steps to ensure the scientific research work of established research groups is promoted, coordinated and managed (paragraph 4.5; **Chapter II Standard I.1**)
- as a matter of urgency, the University develops and implements a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities (paragraph 4.7; **Chapter II Standard I.4 and Chapter II Standard I.5**)
- as a matter of urgency, the University seeks to establish bilateral agreements and projects to facilitate international research activity and mobility opportunities for staff and students (paragraph 4.8; **Chapter II Standard I.3 and Chapter I Standard I.6**).

Affirmation of action being taken

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

Summary of judgements for each Evaluation Area

- 1 The Standards for the Organisation and its Management are **fully met**.
- 2 The Standards for Resourcing are **substantially met**.
- 3 The Standards for the Curriculum are **fully met**.
- 4 The Standards for Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research are **partially met**.
- 5 The Standards for Students and their Support are **fully met**.

Summary Judgement

The reviewers recommend to the Accreditation Council that at Tirana Business University the State Quality Standards are **substantially met**.

Detailed report

Evaluation Area 1: The Organisation and its Management

1.1 TBU's governance and regulatory frameworks are designed to align with national legal requirements for higher education institutions. **[SER p.8]** Its Statute sets out the University's mission, internal organisation and management structures. **[8; A15]** Individual as well as formal board and council responsibilities are also defined in the University's regulations. **[9; A17]** TBU amends and changes its Statute and regulations as required. **[6; 7; A11-13]** The current Statute was developed in 2016 to take account of the new higher education law and is currently with the Ministry of Education for approval. **[8; A15; M1-M3]** **[Chapter III Standard I.1]**

1.2 The University is organised to secure management efficiency in accordance with legal requirements. **[SER p.8-9; 11; M1-3]** The flow of information from departments to Senate, and the promulgation of decisions made by Senate to staff and students, is effective. **[SER p.8-9; B44-50; M2-M5; M9; M10]** Arrangements for the management and administration of the University, and for collegial decision making, take account of legal expectations, work appropriately and are understood by staff at all levels. **[SER p.8-9; B44-50; M2-M4; M9; M10]** **[Chapter III Standard I.2]**

1.3 TBU boards and councils meet regularly and information on agenda items is made available to all staff in advance electronically. **[SER p.9; 17; M2-M4; M9; M10]** The small size of the University and the fact that staff are in frequent contact as a result, facilitates constructive and effective debate. **[M2-M4]** Students and staff indicated that matters raised by them are given due consideration through constructive debate by boards and councils. Examples include changes to timetabled classes and flexibility in assessment hand-in dates for students in full-time work and those who are elite athletes. **[M6]** Arrangements for the operation of deliberative councils and boards, and to support collegial discussion and debate, are understood by staff and students. **[M2-M5; M9; M10]** Deans and heads of departments are responsible for monitoring locally the implementation of decisions made by the University's boards and councils. **[M2-M5; M9; M10]** **[Chapter III Standard I.3; Chapter III Standard II.3]**

1.4 TBU ensures that the limits of its autonomy are respected and that it operates within the confines of prevailing laws and regulations. **[SER p.9-10]** Self-governance is evident in organisational academic and administrative units, teaching and scientific activities, financial and administrative matters. **[20; A27; B9; M2-M5; M9; M10]** The Internal Unit of Quality Assurance reports to Senate and has operational autonomy to supervise internal monitoring and evaluation activities. **[SER p.9; 8; M3; M10]** The Unit has a permanent Head with representatives from each department and the Student Council. Monitoring activities include analysis of student questionnaires, staff self-evaluation reports and a variety of statistical data. **[M11]** The International Advisory Board is responsible for ensuring that the University benefits from European funding opportunities and engages external experts to support institutional activities. The Board has established links with Dutch and UK-based higher education institutions and has submitted applications for Erasmus+ funding, one of which has been successful. **[SER p.10; M3-M5; M9; M10]** **[Chapter III Standard I.4]**

1.5 TBU has an appropriate development strategy for the period 2012-17 which has been approved by Senate **[SER p.10; 19; A29; B11]** The Strategy has been drafted in accordance with the University mission and objectives and was considered during various stages of its development by management bodies and councils. **[SER p.10; M3-M5; M9; M10]** **[Chapter III Standard I.5]**

1.6 The Annual Report to the Ministry provides accounts of teaching and study programmes, scientific research, staffing, project activity and economic and financial matters. **[SER p.10-11; 21; A31; B12]** The drafting process is informed by internal evaluation and self-assessment reports on department and study programme activities. The final report is made available to relevant boards and committees university-wide and is available freely to staff and students on TBU's website. **[SER p.11; link 7; M2-M5; M9; M10]** **[Chapter III Standard I.6]**

1.7 Faculties and departments are organised in accordance with legal requirements. Management, executive, and administrative structures are separate from academic structures and organisational units. **[SER p.11; 22; A32; B13; HEI info on APAAL site]** However, the small size of the University and the multiple roles of some senior staff has led to individuals with a senior administrative role attending meetings with an academic focus. While the review team found no evidence of a conflict of interest, there would be merit in the University reviewing senior staff attendance at all future meetings to prevent any future potential conflict of interest. **[M3-M5; M9; M10]** All academic staff are qualified appropriately and exercise autonomy and academic freedom in teaching, research and all other academic activities. **[SER p.11; 22; A32; B13; HEI info on APAAL site; M2-M5; M9; M10]** **[Chapter III Standard II.1]**

1.8 The University has a network of partners at national and regional level which includes higher education institutions, public bodies, banks and private businesses. **[SER p.11-12; 24; links 8-9; A34]** Academic staff, alumni and placement providers indicated that there are strong links between local and regional organisations and departments and programmes. This, and market research undertaken at institutional level, enables faculties, departments and programmes to be informed appropriately on regional economic development opportunities. **[SER p.11-12; M3-M6; M9; M10]** The Careers Office has effective mechanisms to monitor graduate employment. See also paragraph 5.9. **[SER p.11-12; M2-M5; M7; M9; M10]** **[Chapter III Standard III.1; Chapter III Standard III.2]**

1.9 The International Advisory Board oversees the development of collaboration arrangements with overseas partners while department offices maintain oversight of local and regional collaborations. **[SER p.11-12; M2-M5; M7; M9; M10]** Similarly, collaboration with other organisations to provide students with professional practice opportunities is managed at department level with support from the Careers Office. See also paragraph 5.9. **[Chapter III Standard III.3]**

1.10 The University acknowledges that rates of student and staff mobility have been, and continue to be, low but senior staff anticipate that participation in an Erasmus+ project in 2017-18 will help to address this continuing challenge which is a priority area for development. **[SER p.13-14; M2-M6; M9; M10]** TBU's participation in international activities is currently achieved through organising, in partnership with other higher education institutions, conferences and symposia. **[SER p.13; link 12; M2-M6; M9; M10]** See also paragraph 4.8. **[Chapter III Standard III.4]**

Findings

Good practice

The review team did not identify any features of good practice.

Weaknesses

The review team did not identify any weaknesses.

Recommendations

The review team did not identify any recommendations.

Affirmation of action being taken

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

Judgement

The Standards for The Organisation and its Management are fully met.

Evaluation Area 2: Resourcing

2.1 TBU manages its human resources in accordance with legal requirements, the Statute and regulations providing effective management of human resources. [SER p.15-16; A9; A15; A17] Its organisational chart is published on its website in both English and Albanian. [SER p.15; <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/organigrama>] This chart shows clearly the administrative and academic structure of TBU. [A20; A21] The structure is also set out in the Statute and the rights and responsibilities of both TBU and its staff are set out in the relevant part of the regulations. [A15; A17] There are 16 full-time academic staff currently employed by TBU and these are supplemented by up to 38 part-time academic staff who bring substantial expertise into their teaching and other activities at the institution. [A1; A2; M3] Whereas full-time teaching staff have a contracted teaching commitment of 200 hours per year, part-time staff are more likely to teach between 30 and 60 hours per year. [B52; M4; M10] However, full-time staff who met the review team were not clear on the number of hours that they are contracted to teach. [M10] [Chapter III Standard IV.1; Chapter III Standard II.2]

2.2 Staff vacancies, along with employment criteria for each position, are advertised on TBU's website. [SER p.15; <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/mund-si-pun-simi>; M10] Candidates are invited for interview and successful applicants agree and sign a contract of employment. [B27; M10] Many academic staff have working experience in business as well as academic qualifications, and a number have studied abroad previously. [A32] Recruitment is in compliance with TBU's regulations. [A38; B16] The staff evaluation system facilitates subsequent promotion of staff according to their ability and expertise. [M4] [Chapter III Standard IV.1]

2.3 TBU has a formal system of communicating with staff through an area on the website. [SER p.15; <http://tbu.edu.al/al/lajme>] This gives details of upcoming events and activities, both academic and social, and staff are encouraged to participate. Details of a range of social and cultural events can be found on the website. [<http://tbu.edu.al/al/studentet/aktivitete-sociale>] Staff attend national information days to raise awareness of and give information about the programmes offered by TBU. [A2] Information about these events is also on the website. [<http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/dite-informuese>] In addition, TBU provides social dialogue and activities for the staff and students including the provision of staff life and health insurance. [B27; <http://tbu.edu.al/al/studentet/aktivitete-sociale>] [Chapter III Standard IV.2; Chapter III Standard IV.4]

2.4 Staff skills are assessed periodically by the relevant head of department. [SER p.16; M4; M10] Evidence that is taken into account includes teaching observations and feedback from student questionnaires. [B58] Any deficiencies are also discussed with the relevant dean and activities put in place to address them. [M4; M10] Teaching staff have a relatively low teaching load so there are opportunities for focusing on training or research activities. Some teaching staff are currently working on their PhD programme. [A2] TBU is supportive of international exchanges and is embarking on an Erasmus+ programme but only 20 per cent of staff have worked abroad in the last five years. [Staff Survey] See also paragraph 4.8. [Chapter III Standard IV.3]

2.5 The Development Strategy guides the priorities for each financial year. [SER p.17; B11] Responsibilities for financial management are described in the Statute. [B3] The first stage of the budgeting process is student numbers being agreed with departments and associated income being calculated. [M5] Departments also estimate their costs for academic activities in consultation with the deans and the University draft budget is then prepared by the Administrator. [B3; M5] The budget is discussed and agreed at Senate before being finally approved by the Board of Administration. TBU prepares a financial

budget for three years and has recently updated this to reflect the changes in the Development Strategy. **[A29; A39]** **[Chapter III Standard VI.1]**

2.6 In the first five years of operation TBU recorded financial losses which were covered by shareholders. **[SER p.17; A2]** Currently ABU is recording a modest surplus for 2016-17. **[A2; M5]** Accounts are prepared by a certified accountant and audited by an independent auditor in accordance with Statute requirements. **[A40]** The annual balance sheet and audit report are available in compliance with legislation. [\[www.qkb.gov.al\]](http://www.qkb.gov.al) **[Chapter III Standard VI.2]**

2.7 Performance against budget is monitored monthly and discrepancies between actual and budgeted amounts are small. **[SER p.17; M5]** Academic staff confirm that the budgeting process is transparent and that they are provided with the resources they need for their teaching and research activity. **[M10]** **[Chapter III Standard VI.3]**

2.8 The Secretariat is responsible for collating and disseminating information at the University. **[A2; M11]** Staff have access to an internal intranet in addition to the website. **[SER p.18; A2; M10; M11]** The website contains information including the Statute, regulations, structure and processes and programmes offered by the University. [\[http://tbu.edu.al\]](http://tbu.edu.al) The staff intranet enables staff to have access to other documents that are not for public information. However, although staff and students do have a dedicated email address provided by TBU, there is not a coordinated personal password protected information system where students and staff can access confidential information, for example, dedicated teaching and learning resources and students' grades. **[A2; M6; M10; M11]** The review team considers that the absence of a coordinated personal password protected information system (virtual learning environment) to be a **weakness**. The review team **recommends** that the University investigates and installs appropriate software to enable access to personal information and dedicated teaching and learning resources appropriate to each programme being studied. **[Chapter III Standard VII.1; Chapter III Standard VII.2]**

2.9 There are appropriate facilities and infrastructure for the academic and scientific activity delivered by TBU. **[SER p.19-20; M5; Learning resource tour]** It rents a three-storey building of 1,600m² but owns the contents including all the teaching and learning resources. **[SER p.19; M5; Learning resource tour]** There is a range of classrooms capable of holding between 20 and 90 students, plus two computer rooms, a library, offices, meeting rooms and general equipment needed for teaching and learning. There is also a Business Incubator Centre where TBU offers free support for students and graduates wishing to set up their own business. **[A2; Learning resource tour]** In 2016, the Ministry carried out an inspection of TBU and confirmed that the physical capacity, condition and resources were suitable for the purposes intended. **[A45]** **[Chapter III Standard VII.3; Chapter III Standard VII.5; Chapter III Standard V.1]**

2.10 All classrooms are equipped with projectors, some with smartboards, and all provide a good learning environment. **[SER p.19-20; Learning resource tour]** All equipment is well documented and maintained or replaced as required. **[A41]** There are no sporting or dedicated social facilities provided on TBU's premises but students confirmed that they have access to facilities elsewhere which are suitable and have had some success in sporting endeavours. **[M6; Learning resource tour]** **[Chapter III Standard VII.3; Chapter III Standard VII.5; Chapter III Standard V.1]**

2.11 TBU offers a supporting policy for students with disabilities. **[SER p.36]** A lift provides access to second-floor classrooms but the third floor, where the library is situated, is inaccessible to students with disabilities. In addition, the access ramp at the entrance to the building is steep and narrow which would restrict wheelchair access. **[Learning**

resource tour] TBU has no students with a physical disability but staff indicated that provision would be made to meet their needs on the ground floor should physically disabled students be admitted in the future. **[M11]** The review team found that the lack of access for students with a physical disability to all parts of the TBU building is a **weakness**. It **recommends** that the University develops and implements a defined plan to ensure that disabled students can access all learning and teaching facilities. **[Chapter III Standard VII.3; Chapter III Standard VII.5]**

2.12 Due to the policy of close cooperation with businesses, including shareholders, TBU is developing training packages for businesses in line with its development strategy. It has delivered bespoke professional training for its major shareholder and is planning to build on this in the next academic year. **[A2; A9; M5] [Chapter III Standard VII.6]**

2.13 TBU has in place a system of archiving information, including programme information and student theses both in hard copy and electronically. **[SER p.19-20; A2; A26; A44]** This is in accordance with the relevant articles in the Statute. **[A15]** Each staff member is also able to store information electronically, which is backed up to an external hard drive at the end of each year. Also, all information administered through the Secretariat, for example, minutes of meetings, decisions made, programme information and student records, are archived and kept indefinitely. **[A2] [Chapter III Standard VII.4; Chapter III Standard V.2]**

Findings

Good practice

The review team did not identify any features of good practice.

Weaknesses

The review team identified the following weaknesses:

- the absence of a coordinated personal password protected information system (virtual learning environment) (paragraph 2.8; **Chapter III Standard VII.1**)
- the TBU building not meeting adequately statutory requirements regarding accessibility for disabled students (paragraph 2.11; **Chapter III Standard VII.3; Chapter III Standard VII.5**).

Recommendations

The review team identified the following recommendations:

- the University investigates and installs appropriate software to enable access to personal information and dedicated teaching and learning resources appropriate to each programme being studied (paragraph 2.8; **Chapter III Standard VII.1**)
- the University develops and implements a defined plan to ensure that disabled students can access all learning and teaching facilities (paragraph 2.11; **Chapter III Standard VII.3; Chapter III Standard VII.5**).

Affirmation of action being taken

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

Judgement

The Standards for Resourcing are substantially met.

Evaluation Area 3: The Curriculum

3.1 TBU has a Development Strategy, which includes the bachelor and master's programmes offered in the areas of business administration and law. [SER p.22-23; B10; B11] Details of these programmes are available on the University website and prospective students can also contact the University through social media. [www.tbu.edu.al; <https://www.facebook.com/tbu.edu.al/>] TBU cooperates with secondary education institutions and local education authorities and makes annual visits to high schools around the country to promote their programmes. [A2; M6] Since 2011, the University has organised national competitions where teams of school students compete against each other presenting the best business ideas, business plans or role playing in a legal context. [B15; M4; M6] This is a valuable link with schools, along with open days organised by the Ministry and Careers Fairs organised by the Chamber of Commerce. [M4] **[Chapter I Standard I.1; Chapter I Standard I.3]**

3.2 Business administration and business law are the subject areas that define the University and there are no plans to diversify further. [SER p.23-24; B11] Prospective students apply against defined entry criteria, which are stated on the website and further selection is by a panel interview. [A2; M6; <http://www.tbu.edu.al/al/lajme/kriteret-e-pranimit-neprogramet-bachelor-per-vitin-akademik-2017-2018>] Scholarships are available for students and are based on either merit through the school grade system or needs based, due to financial hardship. [B55; M2] **[Chapter I Standard I.1]**

3.3 The Developmental Strategy defines student employability and career development as the main institutional priority. [SER p.23-24; B10; B11] This is embedded in the programme structure and the subjects studied, reflected in the programme regulations and in the information provided on the website. [B23-B26; www.tbu.edu.al] This also provides a coherent structure which aligns with national requirements for education and training in these subjects. **[Chapter I Standard I.2]**

3.4 Study programme regulations are published for both bachelor and master's programmes. [SER p.24-25; B23-B26] The regulations provide more detail about programme content including subjects taught, credits, teaching hours, internships and assessment. The programmes are aligned with the Bologna Process and the European Credit Transfer System, as indicated in the programme specifications, and allows the transfer of students to and from the University. [B29] Currently there are 461 students enrolled of which 360 are active. [A1; M3] Of the 461 enrolled students, 74 are part-time master's students. [A1] TBU is also able to offer places to students who are in full-time work and also tailored study programmes depending on need. This not only provides education and skills for new entrants but also fulfils the need for lifelong learning of more mature students. [A16; A31; A43; A51; M2; M3] **[Chapter I Standard I.4; Chapter I Standard I.6; Chapter I Standard I.7]**

3.5 Academic staff workload is carefully planned to meet the teaching demands of the programmes. [SER p.24-25; B52] Each programme has a plan which details the teaching hours required per week and per year. [B30-B33] The University has 16 full-time academic staff but has the flexibility to use up to 33 part-time teaching staff to cover the teaching on all programmes. [M3] This also allows for 30 per cent of full-time staff time to be allocated to research activities. [M4] With a teaching load of approximately 200 hours per year for full-time staff, this means that the staff student ratio is 1:20 or 1:12 if part-time staff are included. These figures therefore indicate that the University is working well within its capacity. **[Chapter I Standard I.5]**

3.6 First-cycle (bachelor) study programmes as described and defined on the website and programme regulations provide students with basic knowledge and scientific methods

and principles. [SER p.25-26; B23; B24; www.tbu.edu.al] They enable a progressive transition from first to second-cycle study and with the inclusion of internships also enable progression into relevant employment. Internships are usually paid employment and usually last for between three and 12 months. [B33; B34; M7] The relatively small number of new students enrolled on bachelor programmes every year enable TBU to give personal care and support to each student, particularly during the early part of their studies. [*Chapter I Standard I.7; Chapter I Standard I.8*]

3.7 Second-cycle (master's) study programmes are also described on the website and programme regulations. [SER p.26-27; B25; B26] These enable a higher level of discussion and critical analysis, along with an increased emphasis on research. TBU states that all academic staff are engaged in scientific research and many, particularly part-time teachers, also have other employment in businesses outside the University, which gives them a valuable insight into business to the benefit of students. [A2; M7] All students undertake internships as part of their programme and many are in full-time employment, which facilitates close linkage between study and practical application in business. [*Chapter I Standard I.9*]

3.8 Study programmes are aligned with the Bologna Process and although there are some examples of student mobility this is limited, with 93.90 per cent of students surveyed stating that they had not studied abroad as part of their programme. [SER p.27; B29; **Student Survey**] TBU aims to achieve mobility of students in Europe, and has embarked on an Erasmus+ scheme, but so far the numbers taking part are low, the Student Survey showing that only 6.1 per cent of students have studied abroad as part of their course. [M4; M6] See also paragraph 4.8. TBU also has one course, European Administrative Law, that is delivered in English and approximately seven others that incorporate some English into course materials. [C6] Despite foreign languages, particularly English, being considered a high priority by TBU, students the review team met had limited English language skills. [M6] [*Chapter I Standard I.10*]

3.9 External partners stated that TBU has established close links with business and employment. [SER p.26-27; M7] The relationships with the University included providing internships, providing guest lectures, advising on information systems, careers advice for students, involvement in competitions, contributing to programme development and providing employment opportunities. [M7] TBU also has cooperation agreements with a number of business partners and uses a standard template to confirm these. [B14; M2] The Student Affairs Office, which is run by a full-time member of staff, who is also a student, represents TBU students and promotes debates, social, cultural and sporting activities. TBU supports this activity and provides facilities. [SER p.28; A2; M6; M11; **Learning resource tour**] [*Chapter I Standard I.11; Chapter I Standard I.12*]

3.10 Merging theory with practice through applied learning, internships, applied research and industry links is a priority for the TBU. [SER p.27-28; A2] The Careers Office, along with the relevant heads of departments and deans, is formally responsible for giving students advice on employment. Each student has a 45 to 60 minute meeting each semester for advice on employment and most students are successfully employed before they graduate [A2; M11] Employability statistics are reported in the institutional annual report and summarised in a graduate destinations report. [B12; B53] The direct link between teaching and the application of taught theory in a practical setting in bachelor and master's study programmes which results in employers providing a high number of positive career destinations as noted in paragraph 5.9 is a feature of good practice. [*Chapter I Standard I.11*]

Findings

Good practice

The review team identified the following feature of good practice:

- the direct link between teaching and the application of taught theory in a practical setting in bachelor and master's study programmes which results in employers providing a high number of positive career destinations (paragraph 3.10; **Chapter III Standard VII.1**).

Weaknesses

The review team did not identify any weaknesses.

Recommendations

The review team did not identify any recommendations.

Affirmation of action being taken

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

Judgement

The Standards for the Curriculum are fully met.

Evaluation Area 4: Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research

4.1 TBU has appropriate mechanisms in place to ensure efficient organisation and documentation of study programmes. **[SER p.29-30; A17; A47-50]** The structure of the programme and curriculum content is discussed and agreed in the department and then at the faculty level. **[M5; M10]** The approved version is signed by the Rector, dean of faculty and head of department. **[A56-59]** Syllabi and curricula of study programmes are designed to meet the overall objectives of the programme, which are very clearly stated in the Statute and strategic plan. Within the curricula a wide focus is given to practical learning, which is one of the main pillars of the University. **[A15]** Academic staff update teaching material periodically and keep records of teaching activity in their register, as an official document that identifies the student's attendance, results and effective class hours. **[M10; M11]** Teaching materials are available to students in the form of academic textbooks, transcripts of lectures, handbooks, previously worked papers, communication media and software programmes. The University's infrastructure and the classroom capacity are appropriate for its size. There are two computer rooms containing 14 and 22 computers for students to use during their studies and free hours. **[Learning resource tour] [Chapter I Standard II.1]**

4.2 All examination rules are approved and made available to students, and are displayed in information boards in the faculty halls in different periods of the academic year and also on the website. **[SER p.30; M11; <http://www.tbu.edu.al>]** The University publishes assessment results while preserving confidentiality. Grades of students are given to the Secretariat and then are delivered to students individually through their email addresses. Students can have a period of seven days to lodge an appeal. **[M6; M11]** During this period students have the right to contact the lecturer for any kind of clarification on their examination performance and their grades. **[A46-50; A63]** The TBU provides students who have fulfilled the requirements of their programme with an official diploma. **[B54; B72]** The diploma is accompanied by a supplement, which has all the necessary information on the study programme they have followed. **[B54; B72; M6; M11] [Chapter I Standard II.2]**

4.3 Study programmes are subject to continuous quality assessment procedures, which involve internal quality assurance units. **[SER p.30-31; B51; B68]** Department internal quality assurance units analyse curriculum review and improvement of facilities related to study programme quality, for example, laboratory use, documentation updates, information technology tools, workload ratio, teaching methods and assessment tools. **[B51; M11]** Academic staff part and full-time are regularly assessed by the University structures through students' questionnaires, open lectures and self-evaluation. **[M5, M6; M10]** Findings are reflected in the Annual Report. **[B12]** Study programmes and curricula are subject to continuous improvement to reflect suggested changes from businesses and other partners. As TBU's main objective is to provide their students with theoretical and practical knowledge, it is clearly oriented towards the business need. **[M5, M7; M10] [Chapter I Standard II.3]**

4.4 TBU has a policy of improving teaching quality. **[SER p.31]** Teaching staff are subject to continuous evaluation which is mainly done in three ways, personal evaluation, students' questionnaires and evaluation from heads of departments and deans of faculty. **[M2; M5; M6; M10]** Departments invite specialist guest speakers from a variety of subject areas to discuss relevant topics, bringing added value in class through real-life cases and practical examples which complement the theoretical teaching. **[SER p.31; B12; M6; M10] [Chapter I Standard II.4]**

4.5 In accordance with relevant higher education law and the Statute, the department is the main decision-making unit for teaching, learning, assessment and research. However, while there is clear evidence to indicate that this is the case for the teaching, learning and

assessment functions, the review team was unable to confirm the role of the department in highlighting its strengths and weaknesses in relation to scientific research. [SER p.31-32; M10] The review team identified as a **weakness** the absence of specific research priorities, analysis and discussion within departments. It **recommends** that, as a matter of urgency, the University take steps to ensure the scientific research work of established research groups is promoted, coordinated and managed. [Chapter II Standard I.1]

4.6 TBU has a wide range of agreements and partnership with Albanian businesses to facilitate the institutional objective to prepare students for the labour market. [A15; A31; B14; M2; M4; M5; M7] Students, partner representatives and alumni confirmed that this objective is being achieved. [M6; M7] In addition, it is noted that TBU is using established contacts with business organisations to undertake applied practical research projects. The most important contract they have is with BALFIN, one of the largest business groups in Albania. [A8; A9; <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/partner-t>] However, while the University commits eight per cent of its budget to scientific research, staff were unclear as to how this funding could be accessed to support them in their research. [C3; M10] [Chapter II Standard I.1; Chapter II Standard I.2]

4.7 The Development Strategy 2012-17 does not set out a formal research strategy and is not clear on the process for developing and agreeing institutional research priorities. [SER p.32; B11] The review team identified as a **weakness** the absence of a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities. It **recommends** that, as a matter of urgency, the University develop and implement a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities. [Chapter II Standard I.4; Chapter II Standard I.5]

4.8 The University acknowledges that student and staff mobility has been, and continues to be, poor but senior staff anticipate that participation in an Erasmus+ project in 2017-18 will help to address this continuing challenge, which is a priority area for development. [M2; M4; M5] TBU is in the early stages of developing international cooperation agreements but has not implemented a formal process to enable staff to participate in temporary teaching and research posts at foreign institutions or to collaborate on research projects. [SER p.32; 24; M2; M4; M5] Staff the review team met confirmed that they have not participated in any international mobility for teaching, research or other academic activities. [Staff Survey; M6; M10] TBU has signed an agreement within the Erasmus+ Key Action 1 programme that will start in the next academic year, which has the potential to provide staff with international mobility opportunities. [SER p.10] However, the review team identified as a **weakness** the lack of international research activity and mobility opportunities for staff and students. It **recommends** that, as a matter of urgency, that the University seek to establish bilateral agreements and projects to facilitate further international research activity and mobility opportunities for staff and students. [Chapter II Standard I.3; Chapter II Standard I.6]

4.9 TBU is committed to supporting the outcomes of staff research activities and has an appropriate mechanism in place to oversee the publication of research outcomes. [SER p;32-34] Scientific and research field outcomes are made public through research presentations at conferences, seminars and symposia held at the TBU and through the University's website. [SER p;33-34; link 12; link 14; M5; M10] The progress of research activity is evaluated at department level. [SER p.34] During the period 2015-17, the University organised, in collaboration with national and international partners, 10 scientific conferences to publicise staff research outcomes. [B42; <http://www.tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/konferenca-shkencore>] In addition, scientific research outcomes important to local and regional development have been published through partnerships and local institutions. [<http://www.tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/aktivitete-ne-tbu>] It has been TBU's practice to publicise research outcomes through an effective supporting policy to organise, run and host

international seminars and scientific symposia and this commitment is **good practice**.
[*Chapter II Standard I.7; Chapter II Standard I.8*]

Findings

Good practice

The review team identified the following feature of good practice:

- the University's commitment to publicise research outcomes through an effective supporting policy to organise, run and host international seminars and scientific symposia (paragraph 4.9; *Chapter II Standard I.7*).

Weaknesses

The review team identified the following weaknesses:

- the absence of specific research priorities, analysis and discussion within departments (paragraph 4.5; *Chapter II Standard I.1*)
- the absence of a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities (paragraph 4.7; *Chapter II Standard I.4; Chapter II Standard I.5*)
- the lack of international research activity and mobility opportunities for staff and students (paragraph 4.8; *Chapter II Standard I.3; Chapter I Standard I.6*).

Recommendations

The review team identified the following recommendations:

- as a matter of urgency, the University take steps to ensure the scientific research work of established research groups is promoted, coordinated and managed (paragraph 4.5; *Chapter II Standard I.1*)
- as a matter of urgency, the University develops and implements a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities (paragraph 4.7; *Chapter II Standard I.4; Chapter II Standard I.5*)
- as a matter of urgency, the University seek to establish bilateral agreements and projects to facilitate international research activity and mobility opportunities for staff and students (paragraph 4.8; *Chapter II Standard I.3; Chapter I Standard I.6*).

Affirmation of action being taken

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

Judgement

The Standards for Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research are partially met.

Evaluation Area 5: Students and their Support

5.1 TBU's main recruitment focus, as reflected in the Statute and development strategy, is to improve the quality rather than increase the quantity of students. [SER p.34-35; B3; B11; M2; M5] The admission procedure is in accordance with the legal requirements and also included in the development strategy. [B11] Promotional campaigns for prospective students including visits to high schools and open days are organised annually. [M2; M5; M6] TBU publishes student handbooks and a variety of programme promotional brochures and leaflets. [Learning resource tour] On joining the University, students attend orientation and induction meetings to provide them with necessary information on their programme and the University. [M6; M7] TBU organises competitions for applicants to identify high performing individuals who might be eligible for a scholarship to cover all or part of their registration fee. [B73; M2; M6] [Chapter I Standard III.1]

5.2 Being a small University, with a limited number of students, communication between staff and students is effective. [M6] Every student and staff member has an internal personal e-mail address. [M4; M6] Student personal information, including contact details and grades, is stored securely in the Secretary's Office. [A21; M6; M11] The comprehensive institutional webpage, social media platforms and email provide effective communication channels with external organisations. [SER p.35; www.tbu.edu.al; <https://www.facebook.com/tbu.edu.al/>] [Chapter I Standard III.2]

5.3 Departments and every individual staff member are responsible for the mentoring and tutoring process, which is a continuous process throughout the period of study. [A15] Academic full-time staff have weekly timetabled periods for tutoring students and this information is posted on the website and intranet. [<http://www.tbu.edu.al>] In addition, the Careers Office plays a crucial role in the orientation and mentoring of students by offering assistance during their studies and advising on future internship and employment opportunities. [A15; A21; M6; M11] Discussions with staff and students confirmed the effectiveness of orientation and mentoring arrangements. Students stated that they are provided with all the advice they need through their studies and that they are able to contact staff for individual advice during office hours, lectures and seminars. [M6; M7; M10] [Chapter I Standard III.3]

5.4 TBU grants merit-based scholarships for first-cycle (bachelor) students in three categories; high school students with a high grade point average, successful participants in TBU organised national competitions, and talented individuals that excel in arts, culture and sports. [A15; B73; M2; M4-7] Scholarships for second-cycle (master's) students are also available for bachelor students with a high grade point average. [SER p.36] The University also awards needs-based scholarships to Roma students, students from low-income families, students with health problems, and orphans. [B73; M6; M7] [Chapter I Standard III.4]

5.5 TBU's library also serves as a study space and computer facility for students. [SER p.37; Learning resource tour] The library holds approximately 820 books but it was not clear during the visit as to the number of titles held. [Learning resource tour] The book stock is supported by an online platform for additional literature which provides access to over 40,000 items authored by experts of relevant fields, which can be accessed by students via the internet. [M6; M7; M10] [Chapter I Standard III.5]

5.6 In addition to the formal tutoring process, daily lecturer and student contact provides further opportunities to support and facilitate the progress of first-cycle students. Specific mentoring is provided for year three first-cycle students to support them during their thesis selection and development and to advise on future employment opportunities. [A62; M6] The Careers Office provides students with advice and guidance prior to and during

professional practice or placement opportunities and students are accompanied by a lecturer at their first meeting with a placement provider. **[SER p.37; M10]** Support is also provided on future study opportunities on second-cycle programmes. **[A60; A61; M4; M6; M11]** High-performing students are provided with assistance to enroll on additional courses or advance to fast-track study through an individual academic plan. **[SER p.37; M6; M7; M10]** **[Chapter I Standard III.6]**

5.7 TBU encourages and supports student participation in University life. There is an active Student Council where students debate issues and raise problems associated with their study programmes, study materials, University facilities and social activities, that they would like student representatives to take forward to faculty and Senate for resolution. Students met during the visit confirmed that the Student Council organises activities and addresses problems raised by students during the academic year. **[M6]** Students are represented at Senate by two students and in the Internal Quality Assurance Unit by one student. **[SER p.38; A21; A31; M4]** However, a small number of students met during the visit were unaware of who their student representative is. **[M6]** TBU provides opportunities to engage in paid administrative work in, for example, the Finance Office and Students Affairs Office. **[M2; M5]** **[Chapter I Standard III.7]**

5.8 TBU pursues a supporting policy to assure cultural and sports quality of student life. Students are actively encouraged to participate in a variety of social activities including cultural events, birthday parties, a New Year's Eve party, national holiday events, and other activities designed to help students socialise and connect better to one another. **[SER p.38]** TBU recognises students' talents and achievements in sports, arts and culture and is proactive in attracting such individuals through the provision of scholarships and individual flexibly-managed study programmes. **[B55; B73]** Over 10 students who are involved in professional sports are studying a flexibly-managed study programme. **[M6]** TBU does not have on-site sports facilities but students are provided with free access to rented facilities. **[M6; M10]** **[Chapter I Standard III.8]**

5.9 Students' future employment is the main institutional aim and objective. **[A15]** Student statistics for academic year 2015-16 indicate that from 60 first-cycle (bachelor) and 18 second-cycle (master's) graduates 54 and 18 respectively have gained subject related employment. **[SER p.38; A1; M4; M7]** Students praised the role of the Careers Office in providing support and assistance in relation to future employment opportunities throughout their period of study. **[M6]** The Careers Office also advises and guides students in their choice of internship or practice-based learning provider. **[M6; M11]** The high number of agreements with almost 50 private companies and banks, the Careers Office has negotiated with private businesses and banks is an institutional strength. **[A8; A33; A34; B14;** <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/partner-t>**]** Key among its partners is the BALFIN group, the University's financial backer, which is the largest employer of TBU graduates. **[A9]** The proactive role of the Careers Office in establishing and maintaining partnership agreements with private businesses and banks, which results in high student employment is a feature of good practice. In addition, the Careers Office maintains strong working relationships with alumni and invites them to every academic or social activity it organises. **[M7]** **[Chapter I Standard III.9]**

Findings

Good practice

The review team identified the following feature of good practice:

- the proactive role of the Careers Office in establishing and maintaining partnership agreements with private businesses and banks which results in high student employment (paragraph 5.9; **Chapter I Standard III.9**).

Weaknesses

The review team did not identify any weaknesses.

Recommendations

The review team did not identify any recommendations.

Affirmation of action being taken

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

Judgement

The Standards for Students and their Support are fully met.

Evidence list

List 1

These documents are listed on pages 41-43 of the self-evaluation report under the heading List of Evidence of TBU - Annexes and Links. These documents are referred to in the report as '1', '2', etc.

Self-evaluation report (SER)

- 1 H1.1 Official note from the Ministry of Education and Sports on TBU's reorganization - April 2017
- 2 H1.2 TBU official note sent to the Ministry of Education and Science on institutional reorganization (MoU)
- 3 H2 Results and outcomes of the TBU-Raiffeisen Bank cooperation
- 4 H3 Results and outcome of the TBU-Balfin Group cooperation
- 5 H4 Rector's Decision on initiating the process on 2018-2023 TBU Development Strategy
- 6 1.1 Statute 2012
- 7 1.2 Statute 2014 (Albanian and English)
- 8 1.3 Statute 2016 (Albanian and English)
- 9 1.4 TBU General Regulations (Albanian and English)
- 10 1.5.1 Organigramme 2014 (Albanian and English)
- 11 1.5.2 Organigramme 2016 (Albanian and English)
- 12 1.6 Academic Senate Decision on Council of Ethics staff composition
- 13 1.7 TBU Code of Ethics
- 14 1.8 The General Assembly of Shareholders approval on appointing TBU Rector and Deans
- 15 1.9 Rector's approval on appointing the Chief of Departments
- 16 1.10 Decision-taking process on enhancing program curricula
- 17 1.10-1 Senate Decision on the Internal Unit of Quality Assurance staff composition
- 18 1.11.1 2014 review of the Development Strategy (2012-2017)
- 19 1.11.2 Development Strategy (2012-2017)
- 20 1.12 Decision-making procedure on revising in 2014 the strategy and midterm budget (2015-2017)
- 21 1.13 2015-2016 Annual Report
- 22 1.14 Academic staff members (2016-2017 akademik year)
- 23 1.15 TBU-Business Agreement template
- 24 1.16 TBU-School of American Law Agreement (MoU)
- 25 1.17 Official correspondence with Ministry of Education on TBU National Competitions (Entrepreneurs of Tomorrow and Lawyers of Tomorrow) - 2016
- 26 1.18 Syllabus sample with reading materials in Albanian and English
- 27 2.1 Regulation policy on Recruitment of academic staff members
- 28 2.2 Ministry of Education inspection findings on TBU staff members recruitment procedures - May 2015
- 29 2.3 Procedure on budget-drafting (2017) and budget-planning (2017-2019)
- 30 2.4 2015 Audit Report
- 31 2.5 Inventory of Assets (hardware, equipments, etc.) as of December 31, 2016
- 32 2.6 2014-2015 Annual Report
- 33 2.6-1 Erasmus Project - assets list
- 34 2.7 Syllabus samples of a subject-course incorporating up-to-date bibliography (recent years publishings)
- 35 2.8 Ministry of Education inspection findings on TBU physical and hosting capacities - 2016
- 36 2.9 Regulation on Secretariat's Office (Registrar's Office)

- 37 3.1.1 Program Regulation - Bachelor in Business Administration (concentration: Management)
- 38 3.1.2 Program Regulation - Bachelor in Business Law
- 39 3.1.3 Program Regulation - Professional Master in Business Administration
- 40 3.1.4 Program Regulation - Professional Master in Business Law
- 41 3.2 Academic Sennate Decision on 2016-2017 Academic Structure and study plans
- 42 3.3 TBU Employment Contract of academic staff - sample
- 43 3.4 Concentration - Management) as of 2014-2015 academic year Model
- 44 3.5.1 Illustration case of transferred student to TBU from university abroad
- 45 3.5.2 Illustration case of transferred student to TBU from university in the country
- 46 4.1.1 Study plans - Bachelor in Business Administration (2016-2017)
- 47 4.1.2 Study plans - Bachelor in Business Law (2016-2017)
- 48 4.1.3 Study plans - Master in Business Administration (all programs 2016-2017)
- 49 4.1.4 Study plans - Master in Business Law (2016-2017)
- 50 4.2 Regulations on Practical Work / Internships
- 51 4.3 Dean's Decision on appointing Internship Supervisor (academic staff member)
- 52 4.4 Chief of Department Decision on Thesis and Thesis Leading Advisor (2015-2016)
- 53 4.5 Regulation on the Progress of the Academic Process
- 54 4.6 Thesis Instructions
- 55 5.1 Rector's Decision on establishing ad-hoc Admissions Committee for new students (2016-2017)
- 56 5.2 Illustration of case of student transfer from Professional Master to Master of Science

List 2

The following web links are listed on pages 44-45 of the self-evaluation report under the heading *List of Evidence of TBU - Annexes and Links*. These are referred to in the report as 'link 1', 'link 2', etc.

1. Legal Statutory TBU documents (Statute, General Regulations, etc) <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/dokumenta-ligjore>
2. TBU Organigramme <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/organigrama>
3. Council of Ethics staff composition <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/keshilli-i-etikes>
4. IUQA staff composition <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/sigurimi-i-cil-sis>
5. International Advisory Board <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/bordi-nd-rkomb-tar-k-shillimor>
6. German Chamber of Commerce in Albania (DIHA) <http://www.diha.al/anetaret/lista-e-anetareve/mitgliederverzeichnis-al/?L=131&cHash=-1>
7. Annual Reports <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/raportet-vjetore>
8. Academic activities (seminars, open-forum lectures, study visits) <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/aktivitete-ne-tbu>
9. TBU Partners <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/partner-t>
10. 2016 National Competition <http://tbu.edu.al/al/programet/konkursi-kombetar-2016>
11. Scientific research activity of TBU academic staff members <http://tbu.edu.al/al/programet/veprimtaria-k-rkimore-shkencore>
12. Future of Europe Conference <http://tbu.edu.al/al/lajme/konferenca-e-ardhmja-e-europ-s>
13. Working at TBU <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/mund-si-pun-simi>
14. News <http://tbu.edu.al/al/lajme>
15. TBU Information Days (fairs and site visits) <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/dite-informuese>
16. Social activities <http://tbu.edu.al/al/studentet/aktivitete-sociale>

17. Info on Bachelor Program Studies at TBU <http://tbu.edu.al/al/programet/programme-bachelor>
18. Information on Master Program Studies at TBU <http://tbu.edu.al/al/programet/programme-master>
19. TBU EiPass Center, accredited to provide certified trainings in IT Literacy <http://tbu.edu.al/al/studentet/tbu-eipass-center>
20. Frequent questions <http://tbu.edu.al/al/rreth-tbu/pyetieteshpeshta>
21. TBU Informational Brochure https://issuu.com/tiranabusinessuniversity/docs/tbu_broshura_e_programeve
22. JA High School Teachers Training at TBU <http://www.tbu.edu.al/al/lajme/tbu-trajnimi-i-m-suesve-nga-ja-of-albania>
23. National TBU competition of entrepreneurs of tomorrow and lawyers of tomorrow - 2017 (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report and unreadable)
24. Admission criteria at TBU for 2017-2018 academic year (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
25. TBU training seminars (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
26. Info on employed students as of Feb 201 (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
27. Useful links for employment opportunities (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
28. TBU students in career progress (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
29. TBU entrepreneurship student (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
30. TBU students as participants and winners of national and international competitions (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
31. TBU alumni (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
32. Student Orientation and Career Office (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
33. EBSCO (online library) (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
34. International conferences organised by TBU (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
35. TBU press (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
36. TBU Facebook link (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)
37. Business incubation at TBU (web addressed scanned to Self-evaluation report page 45 and unreadable)

List 3

These documents were submitted to accompany the self-evaluation report. These documents are referred to in the report as 'A1', 'A2', etc.

- A1 General Information Data
- A2 TBU Self-Evaluation Report - ENG
- A3 Complete list of contents in the Self-Evaluation File (dosja e vetevleresimit)
- A4 TBU Self-Evaluation Report (SER / RVB) - Alb
- A5 TBU - Vetedeklarimi
- A6 Aneks H1.1 - Shkrese e ardhur nga MAS per riorganizimin ne prill 2017
- A7 Aneks H1.2 - Shkrese e TBU derguar ne MAS per riorganizimin institucional
- A8 Aneks H2 - Rezultatet e bashkepunimit mes TBU dhe Raiffeisen Bank
- A9 Aneks H3 - Rezultatet e bashkepunimit te TBU me Grupin Balfin
- A10 Aneks H4 - Urdher Rektori per Strategjine 2018-2023
- A11 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.1 - Statuti 2012
- A12 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.2 - Statuti 2014 - alb
- A13 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.2 - Statuti 2014 - eng
- A14 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.3 - Statuti 2016 - alb
- A15 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.3 - Statuti 2016 - eng
- A16 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.4 - Rregullorja e Pergjithshme - alb
- A17 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.4 - Rregullorja e Pergjithshme - eng
- A18 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.5.1- Organigrama 2014 - alb
- A19 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.5.1 - Organigrama 2014 - eng
- A20 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.5.2 - Organigrama 2016 - alb
- A21 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.5.2 - Organigrama 2016 - Eng
- A22 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.6 - Vendim Senati per perberjen e Keshillit te Etikes
- A23 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.7 - Kodi i Etikes
- A24 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.8 - Miratimi i Asembleja e Pergjithshme e Ortakeve per Rektorin dhe Dekanet
- A25 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.9 - Vendim Rektori per Pergjegjesit e Departamenteve
- A26 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.10 - Procesi i vendimarrjes per pasurimin kurrikular te programeve
- A27 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.10-1 - Vendim Senati per perberjen e Njesise se Sigurimit te Brendshem te Cilesise
- A28 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.11.1 - Perditesimi i Strategjise se Zhvillimit 2012-2017 ne vitin 2014
- A29 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.11.2 - Strategjia e Zhvillimit 2012-2017
- A30 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.12 - Procedura e vendimarrjes se ndryshimit te Strategjise ne 2014 dhe plani buxhetor 3-vjecar 2015-2017
- A31 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.13 - Raporti Vjetor 2015-2016
- A32 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.14 - Lista e Pedagoqeve sipas departamenteve per vitin akademik 2016-2017
- A33 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.15 - Marreveshje tip e TBU me partnere te biznesit
- A34 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.16 - Marreveshje e TBU me School of American Law
- A35 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.17 - Korrespondenca me MAS per Konkursin Kombetar te TBU per Sipermarresit dhe Juristet e se Nesermes, 2016
- A36 Fusha 1 - Aneks 1.18 - Shembull Syllabus me literature shqip dhe anglisht
- A37 Fusha 2 - Aneks 2.1 - Rregullore per Rekrutimin e Personelit Akademik
- A38 Fusha 2 - Aneks 2.2 - Konkluzionet e Inspektimit te MAS per procedurat e rekrutimit te personelit akademik ne TBU, Maj 2015
- A39 Fusha 2 - Aneks 2.3 - Procedura e vendimarrjes se buxhetit te vitit 2017 dhe planit buxhetor 2017-2019

- A40 Fusha 2 - Aneks 2.4 - Raporti i Auditimit per vitin fiskal 2015
- A41 Fusha 2 - Aneks 2.5 - Inventari i pajisjeve deri ne 31 Dhjetor 2016
- A42 Fusha 2 - Aneks 2.6 - Raporti Vjetor 2014-2015
- A43 Fusha 2 - Aneks 2.6-1 - Lista e asetete te perfshira ne projektin Erasmus+ KA2 ku ben pjese TBU
- A44 Fusha 2 - Aneks 2.7 - Shembull Syllabus te nje lende me botime te viteve te fundit
- A45 Fusha 2 - Aneks 2.8 - Raporti i MAS per inspektimin e kryer ne TBU per kapacitetet pritesore, 2016
- A46 Fusha 2 - Aneks 2.9 - Rregullore per Sekretarine Mesimore
- A47 Fusha 3 - Aneks 3.1.1 - Rregullore e Programit Bachelor ne Administrim Biznesi, Profili Menaxhim
- A48 Fusha 3 - Aneks 3.1.2 - Rregullore e Programit Bachelor ne E Drejte Biznesi
- A49 Fusha 3 - Aneks 3.1.3 - Rregullore e Programit Master Profesional ne Administrim Biznesi
- A50 Fusha 3 - Aneks 3.1.4 - Rregullore e Programit Master Profesional ne E Drejte Biznesi
- A51 Fusha 3 - Aneks 3.2 - Vendim Senati mbi strukturen akademike 2016-2017 dhe planet mesimore
- A52 Fusha 3 - Aneks 3.3 - Kontrata tip e punesimit per stafin akademik
- A53 Fusha 3 - Aneks 3.4 - Model Suplementi te Diplomes Bachelor ne Administrim Biznesi, profili Menaxhim, deri ne vitin akademik 2014-2015
- A54 Fusha 3 - Aneks 3.5.1 - Shembull Vendim Ekuivalentimi per Student te transferuar ne TBU nga Universitet jashte vendit
- A55 Fusha 3 - Aneks 3.5.2 - Shembull Vendim Ekuivalentimi per student te transferuar ne TBU nga universitet brenda vendit
- A56 Fusha 4 - Aneks 4.1.1 - Planet mesimore 2016-2017 Bachelor Administrim Biznesi
- A57 Fusha 4 - Aneks 4.1.2 - Planet mesimore 2016-2017 Bachelor E Drejte Biznesi
- A58 Fusha 4 - Aneks 4.1.3 - Planet mesimore 2016-2017 Master Administrim Biznesi (te gjitha programet)
- A59 Fusha 4 - Aneks 4.1.4 - Planet mesimore 2016-2017 Master E Drejte Biznesi
- A60 Fusha 4 - Aneks 4.2 - Rregullorja e Praktikes Mesimore / Internships
- A61 Fusha 4 - Aneks 4.3 - Vendim Dekani per percaktimin e Pedagogut Udheheqes per Praktikant Mesimore
- A62 Fusha 4 - Aneks 4.4 - Vendime te Pergjegjesit te Departamentit per Temat e Diplomave dhe Udheheqesit, per vitin akademik 2015-2016
- A63 Fusha 4 - Aneks 4.5 - Rregullore per Mbarevajtjen e Procesit Mesimor
- A64 Fusha 4 - Aneks 4.6 - Udhezimi per Temen e Diplomes
- A65 Fusha 5 - Aneks 5.1 - Vendimi i Rektorit per krijimin e komisionit prites per aplikantet ne vitin akademik 2016-2017
- A66 Fusha 5 - Aneks 5.2 - Shembull transferimi i nje studenti nga programi Master Profesional ne Master te Shkencave ne TBU
- A67 GID_TBU FINAL ME FIRME
- A68 Aneksi H2 - Rezultatet e praktikes Raiffeisen Bank - ENG.pdf
- A69 Fusha 1 - Aneksi 1.10 - Procesi i vendimarrjes ndryshim plani mesimor 15-16 - ENG.pdf
- A70 Fusha 1 - Aneksi 1.12 - Procesi i vendimarrjes per ndryshimin e Strategjise dhe planin buxhetor 3- vjecar - ENG.pdf
- A71 Fusha 1 - Aneksi 1.14 tbu_lendet_pedagoget_2016_2017 - ENG.xls
- A72 Fusha 1 - Aneksi 1.18 - TBU Syllabus - Biznesi Nderkombetar - ENG.pdf
- A73 Fusha 2 - Aneksi 2.3 Procedura e vendimarrjes se buxhetit 2017 dhe planit 2017-2019 -English.pdf

- A74 Fusha 2 - Aneksi 2.7 Shembull Syllabus Menaxhimi Strategjik TBU-English.pdf
- A75 Fusha 3 - Aneksi 3.2 Vendim senati Struktura Akademike 2016-2017-english (1).pdf
- A76 Fusha 5 - Aneksi 5.1 Urdher rektori 19.08.2016 komisioni prites intervistat-english.pdf

List 4

These were submitted a request from the review team for clarification of the original supporting documents. These documents are referred to in the report as 'B1', 'B2', etc.

- B1 Additional evidence requested by the Review Team_Answers.pdf
- B2 Annex 1.2 TBU_Statute 2014-English.pdf
- B3 Annex 1.3 TBU_Statute 2016-English.pdf
- B4 Annex 1.4 TBU General Regulation English.pdf
- B5 Annex 1.6 TBU Academic Senate Decision on Council of Ethics staff composition - English.pdf
- B6 Annex 1.7 TBU Code of Ethics - English.pdf
- B7 Annex 1.8 - TBU General Assembly of Shareholders Decision on appointing Rector and Deans - English.pdf
- B8 Annex 1.9 TBU Rector Decision on appointing the Chief of Departments and Head of Centers for both Faculties - English.pdf
- B9 Annex 1.10-1 TBU Academic Senate Decision on approving IUQA staff composition - English.pdf
- B10 Annex 1.11.1 Changes to development Strategy 2012-2017 English.pdf
- B11 Annex 1.11.2 - TBU Development Strategy 2012-2017 - English.pdf
- B12 Annex 1.13 - TBU Annual Report 2015-2016 - English.pdf
- B13 Annex 1.14 TBU Academic Staff and Subject Courses 2016-2017 - English.xls
- B14 Annex 1.15 TBU Cooperation Agreement with Business Parnters - template English.pdf
- B15 Annex 1.17 TBU correspondence with MAS on 2 national competitions 2016 - English.pdf
- B16 Annex 2.1 TBU Regulation on Recruitment of Academic Staff - English.pdf
- B17 Annex 2.2 MAS official inspection conclusions on TBU recruitment of academic staff 2015 - English.pdf
- B18 Annex 2.4 Audit Report of TBU - English.pdf
- B19 Annex 2.5 TBU Inventory as of 31.12.2016 - English.xls
- B20 Annex 2.6 TBU Annual Report 2014-2015 - English.pdf
- B21 Annex 2.8 MAS official inspection and verification of TBU hosting capacities and infrastructure 2016 - English.pdf
- B22 Annex 2.9 TBU Regulation on the Secretariat - Registrar Office - English.pdf
- B23 Annex 3.1.1. TBU Regulation of Study Program Bachelor in Business Administration - English.pdf
- B24 Annex 3.1.2 TBU Regulation of study program Bachelor in Business Law - English.pdf
- B25 Annex 3.1.3 TBU Regulation of study program Professional Master in Business Administration - English.pdf
- B26 Annex 3.1.4 TBU Regulation of study program Professional Master in Business Law - English.pdf
- B27 Annex 3.3. TBU Employment Contract with academic staff 2015-2016 - template English.pdf
- B28 Annex 3.5.1 Student transfer from a university abroad into TBU - English.pdf
- B29 Annex 3.5.2 Student transfer from a university in Albania into TBU - English.pdf

- B30 Annex 4.1.1 TBU Education Plan - Bachelor in Business Administration 2016-2017 - English.pdf
- B31 Annex 4.1.2 TBU Education Plan - Bachelor in Business Law 2016-2017 - English.pdf
- B32 Annex 4.1.3 Education Plan - Master in Business Administration 2016-2017 - English.pdf
- B33 Annex 4.1.4 TBU Education Plan - Master in Business Law 2016-2017 - English.pdf
- B34 Annex 4.2 TBU Regulation on Practical Internships - English.pdf
- B35 Annex 4.3 Dean Decisions on appointing Internship Program Advising Professor - 2016-2017 - English.pdf
- B36 Annex 4.4. Decision on approving Thesis topics and Thesis Advisors 2015-2016 - English.pdf
- B37 Annex 4.5 TBU Regulation on the Progress of the Education Process - English.pdf
- B38 Annex 4.6 Instructions on Thesis papers and individual research papers - English.pdf
- B39 Annex 5.2 - student transfer between programs within TBU - English.pdf
- B40 Annex H1.1 Official note from MAS on TBU reorganization - April 2017 - English.pdf
- B41 Annex H1.2 TBU official note sent to MAS on institutional reorganization - English.pdf
- B42 Annex S 1 - Decision-making procedure on approving TBU Statute 2016 - English.pdf
- B43 Annex S 2 - Decision-making procedure on approving Regulations - English.pdf
- B44 Annex S 3-Agenda & Minutes Senate Decision 15 April 2016.pdf
- B45 Annex S 4-Agenda & Minutes Senate Decision 17 October 2016.pdf
- B46 Annex S 5-Agenda & Minutes Senate Decision 19 October 2016.pdf
- B47 Annex S 6-Agenda & Minutes of Administration Board meeting 3 October 2016.pdf
- B48 Annex S 7-Agenda & Minutes of Administration Board meeting 10 December 2016.pdf
- B49 Annex S 8-Agenda & Minutes IUQA October 2016.pdf
- B50 Annex S 9-Agenda & Minutes of Ethic Council October 2016.pdf
- B51 Annex S 10 - Regulation of Internal Unit of Quality Assurance - English.pdf
- B52 Annex S 11 teaching staff workload.xls
- B53 Annex S 12-Graduate Destinations By Programme.pdf
- B54 Annex S 14 Example Diploma Supplement.pdf
- B55 Annex S 15-Information scholarship 2014-2015 & 2015-2016.pdf
- B56 Annex S 16 Email notification sent to TBU 3d year Bachelor students to select their profile study program - English.pdf
- B57 Link 11 - TBU Academic Staff engagement in scientific research.pdf
- B58 Annex S 13 - Collated results of students questionnaire 2015-2016.xls
- B59 Aneksi S 1- Procedura e vendimarjes se Statutit 2016.pdf
- B60 Aneksi S 2 - Procedura e Vendimarjes se rregulloreve.pdf
- B61 Aneksi S 3 - Axhenda dhe minutat Mbledhje senati 15 prill 2016.pdf
- B62 Aneksi S 4 - Axhenda dhe minutat Mbledhje senati 17 tetor 2016.pdf
- B63 Aneksi S 5 - Axhenda Dhe Minutat Vendim Senati 19 Tetor 2016.pdf
- B64 Aneksi S 6 - Axhenda dhe Minutat e Mbledhjes Bordit Tetor 2016.pdf
- B65 Aneksi S 7 - Axhenda dhe Minutat e Mbledhjes Bordit Dhjetor 2016.pdf
- B66 Aneksi S 8 - Axhenda dhe Minutat Mbledhja e NJSBC Tetor 2016.pdf
- B67 Aneksi S 9 - Axhenda dhe Minutat Mbledhja keshillit Etikes.pdf
- B68 Aneksi S 10 - Rregullore_NJSBC.pdf
- B69 Aneksi S 11 - Plani i ngarkeses se stafit akademik 2016-2017.xlsx
- B70 Aneksi S 12 - TBU Alumni.pdf
- B71 Aneksi S 13 - Rezultate te permbledhura te sondazheve te studenteve 2015-2016.xls
- B72 Aneksi S 14 - Shembull te nje suplementi diplome.pdf

- B73 Aneksi S 15-Informacion bursat 2014-2015 & 2015-2016.pdf
B74 Aneksi S 16 - Email derguar studenteve viti III bachelor profili.pdf

List 5

These documents were submitted by the University following requests from the review team during the review visit. These documents are referred to in the report as 'C1', 'C2', etc.

- C1 RT Agenda - TBU - 12-13 June.doc
C2 Aneksi S17 - Zberthimi i buxhetit per shpenzimet ne kerkimin shkencor.pdf
C3 Annex S17 - Budget breakdown for expenses on research.pdf
C4 Aneks S18 Plan veprimi për 2016 - 2017.pdf
C5 Annex S18 - TBU action plan for 2016-2017.pdf
C6 Annex S19 - List of TBU courses that incorporate English.pdf

Meetings held during the visit

Meetings are referred to throughout the report using the following abbreviations:

Day 1: Monday 12 June 2017

- 08:45 - 09:00 **M1:** Meeting with Institutional Coordinator.
09:00 - 09:30 **M2:** Meeting with the Rector.
10:00 - 11:00 **M3:** Meeting with the Self-evaluation Team.
11:30 - 12:30 **M4:** Meeting with all members of the Academic Senate (excluding the Rector).
13:30 - 14:30 **M5:** Meeting with all members of the Rectorate and Board (excluding any individuals already met by the review team).
15:00 - 16:00 **M6:** Meeting with a group of students.
16:30 - 17:30 **M7:** Meeting with a sample of external partners and alumni.
18:00 - 18:15 **M8:** Meeting with Institutional Coordinator to clarify any matters arising during Day 1.

Day 2: Tuesday 13 June 2017

- 09:00 - 09:30 **M9:** Meeting with the Institutional Coordinator to clarify any matters arising.
09:30 - 10:30 **M10:** Meeting with a group of teaching staff (excluding any individuals already met by the review team).
11:00 - 12:00 **M11:** Meeting with a group of administrative staff (excluding any individuals already met by the review team).